

Scoring Guidelines for Question 3: Literary Argument

6 points

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<p>Row A Thesis (0-1 points)</p> <p>7.B</p>	<p>0 points</p> <p>For any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no defensible thesis The intended thesis only restates the prompt The intended thesis provides a summary of the issue with no apparent or coherent thesis There is a thesis, but it does not respond to the prompt 	<p>1 point</p> <p>Responds to the prompt with a defensible thesis that presents an interpretation and may establish a line of reasoning</p>
<p>Additional Notes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The thesis may appear anywhere within the essay. A thesis that meets the criteria can be awarded the point whether or not the rest of the response successfully supports that line of reasoning. 	<p>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</p> <p>Responses that do not earn this point:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The intended thesis only restates the prompt The intended thesis is only a generalized comment about the chosen work that doesn't respond to the prompt <p>Responses that do not earn this point:</p> <p>Restate the prompt</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Things are always changing – this includes places and people. A character who leaves their home can never really return to it as it and they are always changing. What matters is how they react to it when they do return" <p>Do not respond to the prompt, but make a generalized comment about the topic of the prompt</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "In Anthem, Equality leaves what he has known as his home and never looks back" "Leaving home is never easy. Coming back home is even harder. Many characters face these problems in a number of books" <p>Responses that earn this point:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The thesis takes a position on/provides a defensible interpretation of the character's response to his or her "home" in the chosen work OR The thesis identifies the character's response to his or her "home" in the chosen work and makes a claim about the meaning of that response to the work as a whole <p>Examples that earn this point:</p> <p>Make a claim about the character's response to his or her "home"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Orestes is an example of someone who returns home only to find that home no longer fits the day to day description. ... Orestes is disgusted by this and feels a need to save the city." (Minimally acceptable thesis) "Whether the home represents an absence or [a] fulfillment, it affects how a character reacts to certain situations. In One Day in the Life of Ivan Denisovich, both extremes are exhibited. While Shukov feels alienated by his "home," Isezar relies on his as a source of physical and intellectual strength" <p>Identify the character's response to his or her "home" and makes a claim about the meaning of that response to the work as a whole</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In Jean-Paul Sartre's <i>The Flies</i>, the main protagonist, Orestes, experiences a disillusionment with the idea of home when he makes his return to [the] city of Argos. Orestes' anger and frustration with the state of Argos upon his return informs every decision he makes for the duration of the play, and it highlights Sartre's greater point: allowing one's decisions to be influenced by external establishments without independent determination is the ultimate disservice to oneself" <p>Make a claim about the character's response to his or her "home" and the meaning of that response to the work as a whole</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Ultimately, [Santiago from Coelho's <i>The Alchemist</i>] is disappointed when he comes home to find that things aren't the same as they once were year prior. Santiago's disappointment helps Coelho display his message: Focus on the present and look forward, never back." 	

Scoring Criteria					
Reporting Category Row B Evidence AND Commentary (0-4 points) 7.A 7.C 7.D 7.E	0 points Simply restates thesis (if present) OR Repeats provided information OR Provides examples that are generally irrelevant and/or incoherent	1 point Summarizes the plot/text without reference to a thesis OR Provides non-specific references to the text OR Provides references to the text that are vaguely relevant AND Provides little or no commentary.	2 points Makes textual references (direct quotes or paraphrases) that are relevant to the thesis AND Provides commentary; however, it repeats, oversimplifies, or misinterprets the cited information or evidence	3 points Makes textual references (direct quotes or paraphrases) that are relevant to the thesis AND Provides commentary that explains the relationship between evidence and the thesis; however, commentary is uneven, limited, or incomplete	
	4 points Makes textual references (direct quotes or paraphrases) that are relevant to the thesis AND Provides well-developed commentary that consistently and explicitly explains the relationship between the evidence and the thesis The response must address an interpretation about the work as a whole	Typical responses that earn 0 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Are incoherent or do not address the prompt May be just opinion with no textual references or references that are irrelevant 	Typical responses that earn 1 point: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Drop in textual references (including plot summary, paraphrase, or quotes) into the response with little or no explanation 	Typical responses that earn 2 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contain multiple inaccuracies or instances of repetition in commentary Offer only simplistic explanations that don't strengthen the argument 	Typical responses that earn 3 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide commentary that is not always well-developed, limited (stops short) and may be piecemeal Assume or imply a connection to the thesis that is not always explicit
	Typical responses that earn 4 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integrate specific and relevant textual references throughout in order to support the student's interpretation 	Decision Rules and Scoring Notes			
	Additional Notes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Writing that suffers from grammatical and/or mechanical errors that interfere with communication cannot earn the fourth point in this row. The response must address the work as a whole to achieve a level of four points. 				

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
Row C Sophistication (0-1 points) 7.C 7.D 7.E	<p>0 points</p> <p>Does not meet the criteria for 1 point</p>	<p>1 point</p> <p>Demonstrates sophistication of thought and/or develops a complex literary argument</p>
Decision Rules and Scoring Notes		
<p>Responses that do not earn this point:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attempt to contextualize their interpretation, but such attempts consist of predominantly sweeping generalizations (“<i>Human experiences always include...</i>” OR “<i>In a world where...</i>” OR “<i>Since the beginning of time...</i>”) Only hint or suggest other possible interpretations (“<i>While another reader may see...</i>” OR “<i>Though the text could be said to...</i>”) Make a single statement about how consideration of the topic relates to a possible meaning of the chosen work as a whole without consistently maintaining that interpretation Oversimplify complexities of the topic and/or the chosen text Use complicated or complex sentences or language that are ineffective in that they do not enhance the argument 		
<p>Responses that earn this point may demonstrate a sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument by doing any of the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Crafting a thesis that demands nuanced consideration of textual evidence to prove – and then successfully proves it. Explaining the significance or relevance of an interpretation within a broader context Discussing alternative interpretations of a text Recognizing and accounting for contradictions and complexities within the text Using relevant analogies to help an audience better understand an interpretation Utilizing a prose style that is especially vivid, persuasive, convincing, or appropriate to the student’s argument 		
<p>Additional Notes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This point should be awarded only if the demonstration of sophistication or complex understanding is part of the argument, not merely a phrase or reference. 		